2016 Committee Members

- **Todd Decker**, Arts & Sciences
- **Hillary Anger Elfenbein**, Business (Co-chair)
- **Pauline Kim**, Law
- **Igor Marjanovic**, Design & Visual Arts
- **Tim McBride**, Brown School
- **Shanta Pandey**, Brown School (Co-chair)
- **Bob Pollak**, Arts & Sciences and Business
- **Shelly Sakiyama-Elbert**, Engineering

*Ex-officio Members:*

- **Lynn McCloskey**, Assistant Provost
- **Lisa Wiland**, Director, Institutional Research
- **Tao Zhang**, Senior Research Analyst
Committee’s Tasks

- Analyze gender pay equity for Danforth campus schools, using 2014-15 pay data
  - Full Appointment Salary
    - Base salary
    - Salary for additional administrative roles
  - Total Actual Pay
    - Appointment salary
    - Summer research: internal and external funds
    - Extra teaching
    - Other pay (honorariums, project pay, etc.)

- For comparison with previous GPE studies, analyses using the former methodology
### Gender Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total Actual Pay (TAP)</th>
<th>Actual Pay Minus Externally-Funded Summer Research (APMESR)</th>
<th>Full Appointment Salary (FAS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Sciences</td>
<td>-4.5%</td>
<td>-1.4%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown School</td>
<td>-7.9%</td>
<td>-3.0%</td>
<td>-2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>-1.5%</td>
<td>-1.4%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design &amp; Visual Arts</td>
<td>-5.0%</td>
<td>-5.0%</td>
<td>-2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>-3.0%</td>
<td>-1.2%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>-6.4%</td>
<td>-6.0%</td>
<td>-3.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Female coefficient negative for TAP for all 6 schools
- Female coefficient smaller for FAS
  - Therefore, much of the gender gap is in supplemental sources

**Negative coefficients indicate women paid less**

**Models include control variables:**
- a rank and discipline salary index variable,
- an indicator for URM,
- indicators for rank and endowed chair,
- indicators for two levels of administrative role (chair equivalent and other),
- and four time variables (years since degree, square of years since degree, years on tenure track at WU, square of years on tenure track at WU)
Female Coefficients: Total Actual Pay

- Whiskers indicate 2 x Standard Errors
Digging Deeper into Supplemental Pay

- A higher proportion of men hold administrative roles with supplemental salary (16% vs. 11%)

- In Engineering, STEM fields of A&S, and Brown School, women are less likely to have externally funded summer research pay:
  - A&S STEM fields: 62% of men vs. 55% of women had external summer research funds
  - Engineering: 75% of men vs. 70% of women
  - Brown School: 89% of men vs. 54% of women

- In Business, among tenured faculty, the average overload teaching pay to men as % of salary was 3.2x as much as to women
### Historical Comparison: 9-Month Equiv. Appointment Salary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2008-09</th>
<th>2011-12</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Sciences</td>
<td>-1.2%</td>
<td>-0.8%</td>
<td>-0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown School</td>
<td>-4.1%</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>-2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>-3.7%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design &amp; Visual Studies</td>
<td>-5.0%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>-2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>-0.8%</td>
<td>-0.6%</td>
<td>-1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>-3.0%</td>
<td>-3.1%</td>
<td>-6.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Mixed historical results**
  - Since 2008-09, smaller gender gap in 4 of 6 schools
  - Since 2011-12, larger gender gap in 4 of 6 schools

Historical approach has multiple indicators for discipline groups, single indicator for salaried administrative role.
Limitations

- Correlation, not causation
- No control variable for quality
- Differences in supplemental pay could result from lack of opportunities offered or a choice not to accept them
- Analyses limited to financial compensation
  - Did not include, e.g., teaching load and releases, course preps, lab space, start-up funds, etc.
- $R^2$ for Law lower than for other schools
Policy Recommendations: Extramural Grants

- External grant funding is outside of WU’s direct control
- NIH evidence suggests gender gap in applications
- Therefore, resources can be dedicated to support maximally competitive grant proposals from all faculty
  - Resources include seed grants, systematic mentoring programs, funds for friendly review
  - Additional proactive administrative support can identify potential grant sources, particularly those calls for proposals spread through networks
Policy Recommendations: Paid Administrative Roles, Teaching

- Deans should report to the Provost the process by which opportunities are offered for teaching pay, summer research pay, course releases, and other sources applicable to the School.

- Greater transparency for supplemental pay
  - Balance confidentiality with sharing information
  - Deans can make available information about extra pay for supplemental source
    - Some faculty may not be aware of extent of these sources.
Policy Recommendations: Salary Negotiations

- Gender gap from less visible sources is consistent with negotiations research
  - Women tend to gain less in salary negotiations
  - Especially ambiguous, discretionary, individually negotiated

- The role of negotiation for pay equity looms large
  - During initial hiring, promotion, and retention

- Deans should be mindful during compensation negotiations

- Deans should report to the Provost yearly the response to each outside offer
  - Explore potential gender inequities
  - Explore whether women less likely to bring outside offers
    - Potentially from family ‘movability’ or lesser gamesmanship
Recommendations for GPE Studies

- **Continue GPE studies every 3 years**
  - Opportunity to monitor potential inequities
  - Opportunity for Deans to see changes over time

- **Maintain improvements in methodology**
  - Total Pay offers more complete information
  - Better explanatory variables
    - Single index variable for discipline
    - Two variables for administrative roles, Criteria for exclusions

- **Additional topics for research**
  - Likelihood of pursuing outside offers
  - Longitudinal analyses
    - Salary discontinuities, time as Associate Professor
  - Pay equity for non tenured/tenure-track faculty